Contents

Contributors    VII

Introduction    1
    Paul W. Kroll

Trading Literary Competence: Exchange Poetry in the Eastern Jin    6
    Wendy Swartz

Shen Who Couldn’t Write: Literary Relationships at the Court
    of Liu Jun    36
    Robert Joe Cutter

Ruin and Remembrance in Classical Chinese Literature: The “Fu on the
    Ruined City” by Bao Zhao    55
    David R. Knechtges

An Offering to the Prince: Wang Bo’s Apology for Poetry    90
    Ding Xiang Warner

Beyond Border and Boudoir: The Frontier in the Poetry of the Four Elites
    of Early Tang    130
    Timothy Wai Keung Chan

Heyue yingling ji and the Attributes of High Tang Poetry    169
    Paul W. Kroll

Who Wrote That? Attribution in Northern Song Ci    202
    Stephen Owen

When There is a Parallel Text in Prose: Reading Lu You’s 1170 Yangzi River
    Journey in Poetry and Prose    221
    Ronald Egan

Judith Gautier and the Invention of Chinese Poetry    251
    Pauline Yu
Trading Literary Competence: Exchange Poetry in the Eastern Jin

Wendy Swartz

Poetics during the Eastern Jin 晉 dynasty (317–420) was largely shaped by xuanyan 玄言, a type of metaphysical discourse that primarily drew topics, ideas, and language from the Yijing, Laozi, Zhuangzi (later collectively known as the “Three Mysterious Works,” san xuan 三玄), and their respective commentaries. Most of the extant examples of xuanyan verse from this period are of the exchange or group variety, products of a social ritual pervasive among the Wei-Jin gentry class. Exchange poetry in the xuanyan mode grew out of “pure conversation” (qing tan 清談), a scholarly practice and social activity with its own rules, criteria, and instruments. These conversations covered subjects ranging from metaphysics to epistemology to behavior and sought reconciliations between ideas from the Three Mysterious Works and the authority of the classics. As an extension of the conversational genre, Eastern Jin exchange poetry accorded the same priority to the Three Mysterious Works. In such poetic dialogues, the writer often skillfully couches his message to his friend in allusions drawn from these philosophical texts. Literary competence is equally required of the reader to decipher the codes within which the message is inscribed. The exchange of poems that draw from a shared and circumscribed set of cultural meanings ultimately affirmed a collective identity. Marcel Mauss observed that in archaic societies the exchange of goods and services served to establish a “bond of alliance and commonality.”
a poem and the return of one between literati men in premodern China was such a form of social compact that identified and banded together a certain group.

Shared appreciation of a select set of texts and interpretations attested not only to the bonds of friendship but also the participants’ cultural stock. In an age in which poetic output increasingly became a type of cultural capital that could be converted into political gain or social prestige, poetic exchanges and social poetry allowed one to display one’s ability to produce and interpret cultural products, a competence that is cultivated and transmitted within families or social groups.\(^5\) The degree of success in producing and interpreting cultural products to a great extent hinged upon one's mastery of texts and allusions. The accumulation and transmission of a certain cultural wealth through the subscription to a set of shared texts and methods as well as goals of study identified the membership of the literati elite and ensured its privileges. In early medieval China, cultural currency was very much based on fluency in xuanxue 玄學 discourse, a repertoire of arguments, notions, and values that permeated the lives and sensibilities of the literati and informed their views on aspects ranging from office, reclusion, and friendship, to the ideal character type and mindset.

A literary competence that specialized in xuanxue topics and terms consummated exchanges between Eastern Jin writers. In a stroke of rare good fortune during the early medieval process of textual preservation, a pair of exchange poems—one by Xie An 謝安 (320–385) and a response from Wang Huzhi 王胡之 (fl. 330–360s)—has been transmitted intact. The other exchange that I will treat in this essay is represented by only the response poem: Sun Chuo’s 孫綽 (314–371) answer to Xu Xun's 許詢 (ca. 326-after 347) now lost poem. The value and interest in examining Sun's response here lie in at least two points: it supposedly summarizes the lost poem and it reveals what literary competence Sun Chuo reasonably expected of his audience, which is of as much interest to our discussion as whether the audience did in fact possess it.

Poetic transactions made through the medium of xuanxue issues and language did not begin in the Eastern Jin, though the trend reached its peak during this period. It is instructive therefore to review briefly an earlier and

well-known set of poetic correspondences from the end of the Western Jin between Liu Kun 劉琨 (271–318) and Lu Chen 劉諶 (285–351).6 In Lu Chen’s tetrasyllabic poem and Liu Kun’s response to it, these two relatives by marriage reflect on recent momentous events in their intertwined lives—from the fall of the north, the death of most members of their families during the turmoil, to Lu Chen’s transfer from Liu Kun’s staff to a new job with the Xianbei leader Duan Pidi 段匹磾 (d. 322), Liu Kun’s rather dubious ally who would eventually order Liu’s execution. Lu Chen expresses hope that Liu Kun will appreciate the meaning behind his words, which are reduced to mere expedient vehicles in the process of communication, following Wang Bi’s 王弼 (226–249 CE) famous application of the Zhuangzian story of the fish trap and rabbit snare to his reading of the Yijing. Lu Chen also invokes the core lesson from Zhuangzi’s “Qi wu lun” 齊物論 to place all things on the same level, which would enable one to become free from emotional entanglements. In response, Liu Kun admits his inability to level with equanimity such things as life and death, for he has found the Zhuangzian notion to be incommensurate to real experience and the clinging feelings of loss. What I want to highlight here is that their meditations on loss, both personal and public, are couched in discussions of big xuanxue topics of the day, such as the lesson of leveling all distinctions and the question of whether enlightened men are immune to feelings, which developed from Wang Bi’s and He Yan’s debate on whether sages possessed common feelings (a point that will be discussed below). This is an indication of the purchase that xuanxue claimed on poetic exchanges during the period. This type of cultural currency becomes even more pronounced as the primary medium of exchange in poetic dialogues after the move to the south.

The poetic exchange between Xie An and Wang Huzhi holds special interest not only because it is deeply embedded in the cultural discourse of the day but also because it brings into play contrary elements in this type of social interaction, such as camaraderie and competition, and personal communication and public performance. Xie An’s life, documented from his early years as a recluse in the Eastern Mountains to his acceptance of office in 360, to his victory over Fu Jian 苻堅 (338–385) in the critical Battle of the Fei River (383), is well known to readers. The addressee of Xie An’s poem, on the other hand, requires some

---

introduction for he is little known today. Wang Huzhi was a prominent member of the illustrious Wang clan of Langye 琅邪 (in modern Shandong). His father, Wang Yi 王廙 (276–322), was the brother-in-law of Emperor Yuan 元 (r. 317–322), and a cousin of Wang Dun 王敦 (266–324) and Wang Dao 王導 (276–339), who dominated the early Eastern Jin court. Although Wang Huzhi regularly ranked among the period’s most celebrated of gentry men, including his cousin Wang Xizhi 王羲之 (303–361), his friend Xie An,7 and the monk Zhī Dun 支遁 (314–366) according to numerous anecdotes from the Shishuo xinyu 世說新語 (Talk of the ages and new anecdotes), his biography remains no more than a rough sketch.8 It would seem that Wang assumed his first post by 334 as Secretarial Aide to Yù Liang 庾亮 (289–340), then garrisoned at Wuchang 武昌, and received his last appointment as the Regional Inspector of Sizhou 司州刺史, but died of illness before setting out for that post. By all extant accounts, he held a steady succession of positions, including Aide 長史 to Chu Pou 虞裒 (303–349), Governor of Wuxing 吳興太守, and Intendant of Danyang 丹陽尹, though the order in which he held these posts is none too clear.9 For the date of his death, modern scholars working with various traditional sources have supplied a wide range of years, from 349? to 371.10 Whether Wang

7 Xie An and Wang Huzhi were also related by marriage: Xie Chong 謝重 was the son of Xie Lang 謝郎, a talented nephew of Xie An, and was a grandson on the distaff side of Wang Huzhi. See Jin shu 晉書 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1974), 79.2087–88.
8 See, for example, Shishuo xinyu jianshu 世說新語箋疏, ed. Yu Jiaxi 余嘉錫 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1993), 8/125, 8/131, 9/60, and 9/85.
9 In Wang Huzhi’s biographical notice (Jin shu, 76.2005), the positions he held are listed in the following order: Governor (of Wuxing?), Palace Attendant, and Intendant of Danyang. Wang’s service under Chu Pou, the father of the Dowager Empress, is mentioned in Chu’s biography. In 345, when the Empress Dowager sought to have her father help administer the state on behalf of the child emperor Mu 穆 (r. 344–361), Wang Huzhi helped persuade Chu Pou to yield that role to the Prince of Guiji, Sima Yu 司馬昱 (320–372). See Jin shu 93.2416. Zizhi tongjian 政治通鉴 gives a different order for Wang’s posts: in 356, he served as the Intendant of Danyang, and in 364, he served as the Governor of Wuxing.
10 Cao Daoheng 曹道衡 and Shen Yucheng 沈玉成 give the dates of (320?-349?); see their Zhongguo wenxuejia dacidian: Xian Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao juan 中國文學家大辭典：先秦漢魏晉南北朝卷 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1996), 20. Cao and Shen seemed to have inferred an approximate birth year of 320, which is the year in which Xie An was born, since Wang Huzhi’s response poem contains lines that suggest their ages were proximate: “One still had a child’s countenance,/ The other just started to don his kerchief” 或 方童顔, or 始角巾. See their Zhonggu wenxue shiliao congkao 中古文學史料叢考 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2003), 211. This approximate year of birth is improbable, since by 333 or 334 Wang Huzhi was serving as a secretarial aide to Yù Liang in Wuchang, according to two anecdotes in Shishuo xinyu (14/24, 16/4). It is unlikely that he held the
Huzhi died before or after Xie An famously came out of reclusion to assume his first post in 360 as Commander under the powerful general Huan Wen 桓溫 (312–373), and therefore whether he exchanged the following set of poems with Xie An while the latter was writing in reclusion or from office, is an uncertainty that renders more challenging (and interesting) the interpretation of Xie An’s poem.

與王胡之詩 謝安

鮮冰玉凝 Fresh ice solid as jade
遇陽則消 Melts when met with sunlight.
素雪珠麗 Plain snow beautiful as pearls
潔不崇朝 Has a purity that won’t last the morning.
膏以朗煎 Because of its shimmer, grease will sizzle away;
蘭由芳凋 For its fragrance, thoroughwort will wither away.
哲人悟之 A wise man understands this,
和任不摽 He bears himself moderately without flaunting anything.
外不寄傲 Outwardly he does not express pride,
內潤瓊瑤 Inwardly he polishes that fine jade of his.
如彼潛鴻 He is like that hidden goose,
拂羽雪霄 Brushing its wing against the cloudy empyrean.

11 See Xie An’s biography in Jin shu 79.2073.
12 In Zhuangzi 4, “Ren jian shi,” there is a passage describing how mountain trees, because they flourish, cause their own destruction by man’s axe, and how grease in the flame, because it sizzles, burns itself up. These metaphors speak to a major point in the Zhuangzi on the virtue of uselessness for self-preservation. See Zhuangzi jishi 莊子集釋, ed. Guo Qingfan 郭慶藩 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2004; hereafter cited as ZZJS), 4.186.
13 I suspect that 雪 is an errant character for 雲.
Trading Literary Competence

Polishing inwardly—what does this mean?

He is tireless in comprehending benevolence.

Brushing its wing—what does this mean?

Loftily perching atop a wutong tree.

It flies high and low, in accord with the right tree,

Twisting and turning, now a snake, then a dragon.\(^{14}\)

Though I tread a different path,

Our tracks are on a level.

Our pleasure lies with the divine cliffs,

We chat together about the wondrous peaks.

Embroidered clouds structured like tabby-weave silk,

Cinnabar haze increases its brilliance.

At Mengsi we admire the sunlight,\(^{15}\)

At Fusang we watch the scattering blossoms.\(^{16}\)

You are among your worthy peers,

Surpassing the common in a phoenix’s flight.

With your store of virtue, you graciously arise,

With an even gait, you lose yourself in the distance.

You, my good friend, and I,

Are neither muddied in freedom nor enshrined in reverence.\(^{17}\)

For silence one does not need cliffs and caves,

In speaking, one does not need to become mired in things.\(^{18}\)

---

\(^{14}\) An allusion to Zhuangzi 20, “Shan mu.” See my discussion of it in this section.

\(^{15}\) Wang Yi glosses the term Mengsi in “Tian wen” as the “banks” of the River Meng, where according to legend the sun sets in the west. Mengsi has also been identified as the legendary Vale of Darkness (昧谷) by modern scholars (e.g., Jin Kaicheng 金開誠 et al. in their edition of Qu Yuan’s collected works and David Hawkes in his translation of “Heavenly Questions”). See Qu Yuan ji jiaozhu 屈原集校注, ed. Jin Kaicheng et al. (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1996), 2:303; David Hawkes, Ch’u Tz’u: The Songs of the South (Boston: Beacon Press, 1959), 47.

\(^{16}\) Fusang, a mythical tree in the east where the sun ascends at dawn, figures several times in Chu ci. See, for example, “Li sao,” in Qu Yuan ji jiaozhu, 1:80.

\(^{17}\) Following Lu Qinli, I have emended gou 狗 to si 西. Zhuangzi once declined a summons from the king of Chu with the parable of a divine tortoise from Chu, which was enshrined for three thousand years after its death. Zhuangzi says that he would rather be alive and free, dragging his tail in the mud, than wrapped, boxed, and stored in reverence. See the chapter “Qiu shui,” in ZZJS, 17.604.

\(^{18}\) The pair of terms “silence” and “speaking” allude to a passage in the Xi ci zhuan (Commentary on the appended phrases) in which it is paralleled to another pair of terms: chu
The li-oak did not mind being a shrine tree.\(^{19}\)

Zhuang Zhou was not fearful of being a clerk.\(^{20}\)

Scattered movements and noises that conceal,
Being able to discern among these is perspicacity.
One who intuits this becomes accommodating,
One who marvelously gets it, sees the meaning.
I perceive in all their sameness,
But things are seen for their difference.

The ebb and turns of Transformation:
Fortune concentrates on a slender shoot.
Beneficent winds descended upon it in vain,
It rises and falls with the times.
Thoroughwort perches under a coat of dew,
Bamboo wears a layer of white frost.
Stamens are dotted with a vermilion luster,
Their scent wafts a pure fragrance.
Any place encountered becomes the Rain Altar,\(^{21}\)
Any river met becomes the dam of the Hao River.\(^{22}\)
I cast my fishing line to the same tune,
And lift my robe to soar together.

At daybreak I rejoice in the bright sun,

\(^{19}\) The li-oak in Zhuangzi 4, “Ren jian shi,” was able to live unscathed because it was perceived as a useless tree. Thus, it does not mind being a tree that merely marks the local shrine. See ZZJS, 4.170.

\(^{20}\) According to the Shi ji (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982), 63.2143, Zhuangzi once held the office of “clerk of the lacquer garden” (qi yuan li 漆園吏) in Meng (in the state of Liang). Just as the yue-oak did not mind being useless, Zhuangzi did not mind be useful (i.e., in service). Both the li-oak and Zhuangzi are represented to have transcended such a distinction.

\(^{21}\) In the Analects (11/26), Zengzi had expressed a particular wish to go with some men and boys to bathe in the Yi River in late spring, enjoy the breeze on the Rain Altar, and go home chanting poetry. Confucius heartily concurred.

\(^{22}\) Zhuangzi once asserted to Huizi that he knows the joy of fish swimming in the Hao River by standing beside the river. See Zhuangzi 17, “Qiu shui” (Autumn floods).
Whistling and singing through the wooded hills.

In the evening, I take pleasure in the moon,\textsuperscript{23}

Then enter my chamber to strum my zither.

The five strings are pure and stirring,

The southern breeze brushes against my robe.

Fine ale quenches my worries,

Subtle words cleanse my mind.

To whom can I express hidden feelings?

The one who understands my tune.\textsuperscript{24}

It would be reasonable for the modern reader, without knowledge of the historical context of the poem's composition, to delineate the following narrative: Xie An praises his friend's outstanding talent as the latter is poised “to take a phoenix’s flight,” a conventional metaphor for elevation to a post (ll. 27–28). In contrast, Xie An has charted a “different path” (l. 19), whose elevation is instead measured by the heights reached as he soars together with lofty-minded worthies of the past (ll. 51–54). Having recognized the danger of prominence in the examples of grease that burns itself out or the thoroughwort that wears itself out (ll. 5–6), he chooses instead to “cast a fishing line” (l. 53), an activity associated with the quietist life. The image of Fortune's beneficent winds vainly descending upon a slender shoot (ll. 43–46) might then sensibly be taken as a reference to the series of summonses that Xie An has received and declined. Indeed Xie's portrait of his life in the poem's last stanza bears all the markers of reclusion: the leisure and pleasure of roaming through the hills, singing, and playing the zither; a pure and carefree state of mind aided by the temperate southern breeze, fine ale, and the subtle words of xuan learning.

However, there is another plausible reading that can be substantiated by other images and even by some of the very same ones discussed above. In the alternate narrative, Xie An tries to persuade his friend that there is no difference between office and reclusion, since it is the mind rather than place that truly matters. Presumably writing from office, then, Xie An alludes to core lessons from “Qi wu lun” on the virtue of setting all things on the same level (ll. 19–20) and of seeing oneness instead of difference (ll. 41–42) as a prelude for

\textsuperscript{23} Chuxueji cites a passage not found in the extant version of the Huainanzi in which the term wangshu is glossed as “charioteer of the moon.” See Chuxueji 初學記 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2004), 1.8. Wang Yi 王逸 in his commentary to Chuci 楚辭 also glosses the term thus. The term, by metonymy and periphrasis, also means the moon.

\textsuperscript{24} Lu Qinli 鄱欽立, ed., Xian-Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao shi 先秦漢魏晉南北朝詩 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1983), 905–6.
claiming spiritual transcendence over material position. For Xie An, what is important in this process is the ability to adapt with the times or to external circumstances. Previously, Xie An received and declined calls to office, but he understood that one “rises and falls with the times” (ll. 45–46). This echoes an earlier allusion to the Zhuangzi in the poem: “It flies high and low, in accord with the right tree./ Twisting and turning, now a snake, then a dragon” (ll. 17–18). In the chapter “Shan mu” (Mountain tree), Zhuangzi’s disciple questions him about his definitive view on uselessness, which he generally champions over usefulness as a better strategy for self-preservation. This inquiry was prompted by an observation that worthlessness has led to diametrically opposite results: the worthlessness of a tree allowed it to live unharmed whereas that of a goose which could not cackle ensured that it was the first to be killed for dinner. Zhuangzi’s response is both characteristically playful yet ironically flighty, reinforcing in fact an emphasis in his philosophy on adaptability and freedom from any fixed stance. In his response to his disciple, he stakes a new position, now somewhere between worth and worthlessness, only immediately to undermine the very rationality of that place, in an infinite deferral of a stable determination.

Zhuangzi says smiling: “I, Zhou, would take a position somewhere between worth and worthlessness. Somewhere between worth and worthlessness seems like the place to be, but it really isn’t. Hence you’ll never be freed of trouble there. It would be quite different, however, if one were to ride upon the way and its virtue and drift and roam about: neither praised nor censured, now a dragon, then a snake, changing with the times, and never willing to hold to one thing alone. Now up, now down, using harmony as one’s measure, drifting and roaming with the ancestor of ten thousand things, treating things as things, but not letting things treat you as a thing—therefore how could you be burdened by trouble?”

In the Zhuangzi story, keeping to determined hierarchies and rigid categories contradicts the Way. Indeed, throughout his philosophy the author continually challenges even his own statements to make that point. In Xie An’s application,
service and reclusion neither entail definitive stances nor set appraisals. Rather the Zhuangzi teaches one to “take harmony as one’s measure” (yi he wei liang 以和為量). Moreover, Xie An reminds his reader that even Zhuangzi had accepted office and did not fear that the position would detract from his presumed transcendence and freedom (l. 36). The ability to view service and reclusion with flexibility and parity marks a distinct medieval kind of spiritual superiority: perspective is freed of physical position and derives instead from an elevation of mind. The enjoyment of the quietist life described in the last stanza is made more remarkable, then, by the official position he occupies.

These two rather different narratives pieced together from Xie An’s poem would forever hang in a precarious and uncertain balance had Wang Huzhi’s response poem not survived, as was the fate of many poems during the medieval process of textual transmission, which more often than not left an exchange poem that fortunately survived without its partner. Although Wang Huzhi and Xie An may well have exchanged more than one poem over the course of their friendship which spanned decades, structural similarities and rhetorical resonances beyond thematic commonalities identify the two poems as belonging to a pair, as we will soon see. Wang Huzhi’s response casts Xie An in a role that later readers, whose imagination has been largely shaped by stories of Xie An playing the high-minded recluse in the Shishuo xinyu, are less accustomed to seeing: the one who persuades or rallies another to take a post.

答謝安詩

王胡之

荊山天峙

Mount Jing rises into the heavens,

辟立萬丈

Its cliffs stand over ten thousand meters.

蘭薄暉崖

A thoroughwort patch glows on the precipice,

瑤林激響

An emerald forest stirs making echoes.

哲人秀舉

A wise man distinguishes himself in his fineness,

和璧夜朗

Bian He’s jade even sparkles at night.26

凌霄矯翰

Lifting its feathered wings to soar to the empyrean,

26 A popular allusion signifying real worth and the ability to discern it. Han Feizi 13 tells the story about Bian He, who found a precious piece of crude jade in the mountains of Chu. He presented the gem to two successive kings of Chu, whose gem experts deemed the stone in question to be only ordinary. Each time, the king ordered one of Bian He’s legs to be cut off as punishment. Legless, Bian He wailed at the foot of Mount Jing, lamenting that the precious gem would go unacknowledged. When the next Chu king heard about this, he had his gem expert examine the stone and this time it was recognized for its worth. See Han Feizi ji jie 韓非子集解 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1998) 4.95, and Yiwen leiju 藝文類聚 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1999), 7.135–36.
希風清往 — It anticipates winds to carry it to purity.

矫翰伊何 — Lifting its feathered wings—what does this mean?
羽儀鮮潔 — His bearing and behavior are fresh and flawless.
清往伊何 — Going to purity—what does this mean?

自然挺徹 — He is steadfast and penetrating in a natural way,
易達外暢 — His ease of understanding is outwardly expressed,
聰鑒內察 — His sharp reflection inwardly examines.

朱火炎上 — Crimson fire burns upwards,
淥水赴泉 — Clear water goes toward the spring.
風以氣積 — Winds are formed by vapors accumulating,

冰由霜堅 — Ice is made by frost hardening.
妙感無假 — Such marvelous reactions rely on none other,
率應自然 — Such direct responses are self-so and natural.

我雖異韻 — Though my tune is different than yours,
及爾同玄 — I share with you a pursuit of the mysterious.
如彼竹柏 — Like those bamboos and cypresses,
厲飄俱鮮 — After a gale of wind, both fresher still.

利交甘絕 — Friendships forged in profit may be sweet but doomed to end,

仰違玄指 — They contradict the teachings of the mysterious.
君子淡親 — Friendships of a gentleman are insipid but lead to affection.
湛若澄水 — They are transparent as limpid water.

27 Yi yi literally means “feathers [used as] a model,” a meaning derived from the Top Yang of Yijing hexagram 53, “Jian” (Gradual advance): “The wild goose gradually advances to the highland. Its feathers can be used as a model...” Wang Bi explains that this one has “progressed to a place that is lofty and pure; he is not burdened by his position, so that nothing can subdue his mind or confuse his intent. He towers loftily in the clear distance: this model is one that can be honored.” Wang Bi jiaoshi, 2:485–86; trans. Richard John Lynn, The Classic of Changes: A New Translation of the I Ching as Interpreted by Wang Bi (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 1994), 477.

28 Zhuangzi 20, “Shan mu,” compares the friendship of gentlemen against that of small men: see my discussion in this section. ZZJS, 20.685.
Me and my good fellow,
We forget about one another as we lean against an armrest.\(^{29}\)
To live in “Peace” and not expect prominence,
Misery is linked with “Obstruction.”\(^{30}\)
The world of men is truly hazardous,
To navigate it calls for a man of knowledge and perspicacity.
Your talent shines brilliantly in statecraft,
And can also obliterate any differences.
I shall dull my spirit, conceal my ailments,
Best to dwell upon no affair.
Approach things according to their nature,
Then each gains its own fulfillment.
Be it long or short, abide only in genuineness,\(^{31}\)
Then each may be equal to its destiny.

In the past, we fêted and roamed together,
A tender attachment formed since our childhood.
One still had a child’s countenance,
The other just started to don his kerchief.
I lift my robe and grasp onto my cloak,
To wash myself in pure water to [dispel?] any base thoughts.

---

\(^{29}\) In the opening of Zhuangzi \(2, “Qi wu lun,” \) Nanguo Ziqi “leaned against an armrest” (\(yin ji隐机\)) with a look of profound detachment and tranquility. He describes contemplating the piping of Heaven, which blows on the myriad things in different ways so that each may be self-so, and compared it against the lesser kinds of piping of earth and men. See ZZJS, 2.43–50.

\(^{30}\) The sequential order of the Yi\(\text{jing}\) hexagram 11 “Tai” 泰 (Peace) and hexagram 12 “Pi” 否 (Obstruction) posits that the depletion of Peace leads to (“is linked with”) the rise of Obstruction, during which, according to the Xiang zhuan 象傳 (Commentary on the images) warning, the gentleman should not receive rank and salary and should “hold back his virtue to avoid calamity.” Wang Ri ji jiaoshi, 1:276–82.

\(^{31}\) In Zhuangzi 24, the titular character, the lowly and poor Xu Wugui 徐无鬼, levels his position with that of Marquis Wu before teaching the latter on governance: “That which Heaven and earth nourish is the same. To have climbed to a high position cannot be considered an advantage; to dwell in low station cannot be considered a disadvantage.” The comparison here implies by extension the difference between office and reclusion. ZZJS, 24.826.
壑無深流  The ravine has no deep current,
丘無囂仞  The hills have no measure of clamor.
今也華髮  Today both with our white hair,
卑高殊韻  High and low, we sing to a different tune.
形跡外乖  The paths we tread may disagree on the surface,
理暢內潤  The truths we freely express nourish us both inside.

巢由坦步  Chaofu and Xu You trod an even pace,
稷契王佐  Ji and Xie aided sage kings.
太公奇拔  The Grand Minister was outstandingly rare,
首陽空餓  Bo Yi and Shu Qi starved in vain on Mount Shouyang.
各乘其道  Each journeys along his own way,
兩無貳過  And neither is wrong.
願弘玄契  I wish to advance points of mystery,
廢疾高臥  Handicapped by illness, I recline in loftiness.

來贈載婉  What you presented to me is congenial,
妙有新唱  In its subtlety, there are new notes.
博以兼濟  It breadthens me with the teaching of bringing succor to all,
約以理當  And it keeps me to correct principles.
非不悅子  It is not that I do not want to please you,
駑驥殊量  It is just that nags and chargers have different capacities.
鳥養養之  Nourish a bird with what would nourish it,
任其沈颺  Let it plunge or soar as it would.
取諸胸懷  I gather my various meditations,
寄想郢匠  And send my thoughts to the carpenter at Ying.

32 According to the Gaoshi zhuan (Accounts of high-minded men), the legendary recluse Xu You washed his ears at the Ying River after hearing sage-king Yao’s offer to make him the leader of the Nine States. Later his friend Chaofu berated Xu You for making himself prominent rather than secluding himself as a proper recluse should. See Huangfu Mi, Gaoshi zhuan (SBBY), 1.3a.
33 Virtuous ministers who served under sage-kings Yao and Shun.
34 Taigong, or Taigong Wang 太公望, was discovered by King Wen and later aided King Wu in the conquest of Shang and founding of Zhou.
35 The famous pair of Shang dynasty brothers who chose to starve themselves by eating only bracken on Mount Shouyang, rather than live in the service of the new Zhou dynasty.
36 This line draws from Analects 6/3, in which Confucius praises Yan Hui for “never making the same mistake twice” (bu er guo 不貳過).
37 An allusion to Zhuangzi 18, “Zhi le” 至樂, in zzjs, 18.621. See my discussion below.
38 Xian-Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao shi, 886–87. In a parable about sympathetic understanding between friends from Zhuangzi 24, “Xu Wugui,” a plasterer in Ying 鄱 (capital of
Whereas Xie An noted that he and Wang tread upon different paths but leveled that difference, Wang Huzhi affirms their different tunes and maintains the distinction. Rather than to see the different as really the same, as Xie claimed with reclusion and service, Wang accepts differences as each simply acting according to its own nature. For Wang, neither service nor reclusion is categorically or inherently right or wrong: in stanza 7, he juxtaposes ancient ministers (Ji, Xie, and Taigong Wang) with legendary recluses (Chaofu, Xu You, Bo Yi, and Shu Qi) to illustrate the argument that differences cannot be assessed by any fixed, absolute notion of correctness: they were each celebrated for the different paths they chose. Beyond right and wrong, reclusion or service each allows different natures to find their own fulfillment. In stanza 5, Wang duly distinguishes his nature and destiny from Xie An’s. Unlike his friend, Wang believes he lacks the requisite knowledge and perspicacity to maneuver through the perilous world of affairs. Xie An’s talent enables him to master the art of statecraft as well as level all differences, a praise covering both his achievement in public service as well as in xuan-learning. By contrast, Wang Huzhi pledges to dull his spirit, conceal his ailments, for he deems it best “to dwell upon no affair” (l. 40).

Wang Huzhi seems to have drawn a different lesson from “Qi wu lun” to justify his stance. In the same stanza, he writes:

遇物以器 Approach things according to their nature,
各自得意 Then each gains its own fulfillment.
長短任真 Be it long or short, abide only in genuineness,
乃合其至 Then each may be equal to its destiny.

In the famous parable of the autumn hair and Mount Tai, as interpreted by Guo Xiang 郭象 (d. 312), difference is not denied, but rather all things are unified by the same act of each fulfilling its own nature:

To make a comparison in terms of physical form, then Mount Tai is larger than the tip of an autumn hair. But if each accords with its own nature and function, and things tacitly harmonize with their ultimate capacity, then the largeness of a physical form is not excessive and the smallness of a physical form is not insufficient. If each is sufficient to its own nature,
then the tip of an autumn hair would not singularly consider its smallness as small and Mount Tai alone would not singularly consider its largeness as large. If that which is sufficient to its own nature is considered large, then nothing under heaven is more sufficient than the tip of an autumn hair. If that which is sufficient to its own nature is not considered large, then even Mount Tai can be called small.39

Large and small are neither absolute nor even meaningful terms: the key is for something to be “sufficient to its own nature” (zu yu qi xing 足於其性) and “tacitly harmonize with its ultimate capacity” (wu ming qi ji 物冥其極). Wang Huzhi adapts the rhetoric from Guo Xiang’s commentary in his argument responding to Xie An’s insistence on seeing only sameness where others see difference (ll. 41–42). Wang seems to tell his friend this: “be it long or short’ (that is to say, office for you and withdrawal for me), we must each abide in our genuine nature. Only then may each of us be equal to our own destinies or capacities.”

We must also consider that Wang Huzhi’s emphasis on acting according to one’s nature and capacity may have been as much a philosophical argument as perhaps an assessment of his own physical circumstances. Although he refers to their “white hair” (l. 53) and proximate age in the poem (“One still had a child’s countenance,/ The other just started to don his kerchief”), he was almost certainly older than Xie An, given the arithmetic possibilities of these known dates: Wang was serving on Yu Liang’s staff by 334 and Xie was born in 320. Wang could hardly have entered service to aid the most powerful man at court as a mere pubescent. As well, the excuse of an illness in line 39 and again in line 64 was surely no gesture of demureness on Wang’s part: he suffered from what was probably epilepsy (feng xuan ji 風眩疾) throughout his life. He was said to have “long fits of the shakes, while keeping his wits about him.”40

Seen from this light, the implicit comparison of Xie An to a charger and himself

40  Jin shu, 79.2073
to a nag in the last stanza seems more a realistic appraisal than conventional, polite self-subordination in literary exchanges.

Both Xie An and Wang Huzhi drew from the same xuanxue repertoire what each needed to make different arguments about their respective advocacy, office or reclusion. According to Xie An, engagement is no different from seclusion if one’s mind transcends physical place. To be able to see all things as leveled renders any place the Rain Altar from the *Analects* and any river the dam of the Hao River from the *Zhuangzi*, both symbolic of spiritual detachment and lofty enjoyment. For Wang Huzhi, differences are differences, but there is neither right nor wrong so long as each acts according to its own nature. Wang reinforces his point with another allusion to the *Zhuangzi* in his final plea to his friend for a sympathetic understanding of his particular nature and capacity, reminding Xie An what Carpenter Shi had shown to his friend the plasterer of Ying in yet another story from the *Zhuangzi*:

鳥養養之
任其沈鵄
取諸胸懷
寄想郢匠

Nourish a bird with what would nourish it,
Let it plunge or soar as it would.
I gather my various meditations,
And send my thoughts to the carpenter at Ying.41

In *Zhuangzi* 18, Confucius tells the parable of the sea bird and Marquis of Lu to his disciple Zigong. Once when a sea bird landed in the suburbs of Lu, the marquis thought it would be grand to treat it to banquets and entertainment. The bird, confused and sad, did not eat or drink anything and was dead within three days. “This is to nourish the bird with what would nourish oneself, and not to nourish the bird with what would nourish it” 此以己養養鳥也，非以鳥養養鳥.42 Wang Huzhi tells Xie An in no uncertain terms the type of nourishment best suited to him: he merely wishes to “advance points of mystery” and “recline in loftiness” (ll. 63–64). For Xie An to attempt to feed Wang his own type of nourishment, that is to say, success in statecraft, could only lead to an unfortunate end for Wang.

Xuanxue notions and values also deeply colored their discourse on the ideal character type. This conversation seems to begin as an exercise in trading compliments. In the opening stanza of his poem, Xie An describes “the wise man” (zheren 哲人), or his idealized notion of Wang Huzhi, in terms indicating the early medieval values of outward modesty and inward cultivation:

---

41 See n. 37 above.
42 ZZJS, 18.621.
哲人悟之  A wise man understands this,  
和任不摽  He bears himself moderately without flaunting anything.  
外不寄傲  Outwardly he does not express pride,  
内潤瓊瑤  Inwardly he polishes that fine jade of his.

In the fourth stanza, description seems to turn into prescription as Xie An appears to give lesson on how the ideal man should behave:

默匪巖穴  For silence one does not need cliffs and caves,  
語無滯事  In speaking, one does not need to become mired in things.  
樺不辭社  The li-oak did not mind being a shrine tree,  
周不駭吏  Zhuang Zhou was not fearful of being a clerk.  
紛動囂翳  Scattered movements and noises that conceal,  
領之在識  Being able to discern among these is perspicacity.  
會感者圓  One who intuits this becomes accommodating,  
妙得者意  One who marvelously gets it, sees the meaning.

This calls to mind Wang Bi’s famous response to He Yan about whether sages possessed emotions. He Yan had opined that the sages were free from feelings of pleasure, anger, sadness or joy, but Wang Bi argued that sages, like others, have common emotions. However, unlike others, the sages possess an uncommon, numinous intelligence that enables them to identify with nothingness. Thus, according to Wang Bi, their emotions are such that “they respond to things, but without becoming attached to things” 應物而無累於物.43 Just as the sages could possess feelings without being burdened by them, the wise man could enter service without being weighed down by the trammels of office. For Xie An, superior understanding, or perspicacity, consists in the ability to see through and filter out the clutter of movements and noises in the mundane world.

Not exactly in return, Wang Huzhi’s portrait of the ideal man seems to apply more to himself than to his friend. The lines emphasizing inward examination and a behavior that is pure, natural, and flawless read like the self-justification of a man trying to deflect an unwanted proposition from a friend.

矯翰伊何  Lifting its feathered wings—what does this mean?  
羽儀鮮潔  His bearing and behavior are fresh and flawless.

---

43 See Wang Bi’s biography by He Shao, as appended to Zhong Hui’s biography in Sanguo zhi 三國志 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982), 28.795.
清往伊何  Going to purity—what does this mean?
自然挺徹  He is steadfast and penetrating in a natural way,
易達外暢  His ease of understanding is outwardly expressed,
聰鑒內察  His sharp reflection inwardly examines.

Moreover, the intent of the wise man in Wang’s version lies not in the “comprehension of benevolence” (ren tong 仁通) as in Xie’s idealized version of either the wise man or Wang Huzhi, but rather in a certain purity (qing 清), which is consistent with the quietist tenor of his response poem.

Friendship is the context of the exchange between Wang and Xie, but it is also a main subject of discourse in Wang Huzhi’s poem. Again Zhuangzian values inform his conception.

利交甘絕  Friendships forged in profit are sweet but doomed to end,
仰違玄指  They contradict the teachings of the mysterious.
君子淡親  Friendships of a gentleman are insipid but lead to affection,
湛若澄水  They are transparent as limpid water.

A passage from Zhuangzi 20, “Shan mu,” contrasts the friendship of a gentleman against that of a small man: the former is “insipid like water” (dan ruo shui 淡若水), while the latter is “saccharine like sweet wine” (gan ruo li 甘若醴). “The insipidness of the gentleman’s friendship leads to affection, whereas the sweetness of the small man’s friendship leads to its end” 君子淡以親，小人甘以絕.44 The insipid leads to affection precisely because it can last through the process. Indeed, affects held in reserve tend to retain their strength and longevity. This contrasts with the flavorful, “whose intensity and seductiveness are doomed to wear themselves out,” to borrow François Jullien’s astute observation on the virtue of blandness.45 This lesson on insipid versus sweet friendship from the Zhuangzi resonates with that on prominence and reserve, to which Xie An alluded in these lines from stanza 1:

膏以朗煎  Because of its shimmer, grease will sizzle away;
蘭由芳凋  For its fragrance, thoroughwort will wither away.

44 ZZJS, 20.685.
A passage from *Zhuangzi* 4, “Ren jian shi” (Affairs in the world of men), describes how mountains and trees, because they flourish, cause their own destruction by man’s axe, and how grease in the torch, because it shimmers, burns itself up.\(^{46}\) Expenditure leads to exhaustion, whereas reserve carries to preservation.

*Xuanxue* values not only articulate Wang’s notion of friendship but ultimately identify his friends. Wang Huzhi reminds Xie An that their relationship has been sustained through a shared pursuit of *xuan*, despite any superficial difference that Xie has (rather relentlessly) attempted to suppress.

我雖異韻
及爾同玄
(ll. 23–24)

形跡外乖
理暢內潤
(ll. 55–56)

By this account, a pursuit of *xuan* has forged a unity between two men of different vocations, which Wang Huzhi has reduced to a matter of mere superficial difference. More broadly, the early medieval intellectual class used this pursuit as a self-identifying marker, cutting across not only different vocations but even different time periods and religious orders. Sun Chuo provides a good illustration of this point in his “Discussion on Monks and Worthies” (*Dao xian lun* 道賢論), which compares seven monks with the Seven Worthies of the Bamboo Grove. He identifies the monk Zhi Dun with the *xuanxue* scholar Xiang Xiu 向秀 (ca. 227–272) on the basis of a common pursuit: “[both] greatly esteem the *Zhuangzi* and *Laozi*. Although the two masters were of different times, they shared in the same aloof air and a fondness for *xuan*” (*feng hao xuan tong* 風好玄同).\(^ {47}\)

Sun Chuo’s poem to Xu Xun is perhaps one of the most significant examples of the cultural currency in which writers of that period traded, partly because the two were considered the deans of *xuanyan* poets and partly because his poem is steeped in *xuanxue* terms and notions. In Sun Chuo’s poem, the *Laozi* and *Zhuangzi* lead as the most dominant source texts and references to Lao-

\(^{46}\) See *ZZJS*, 4.186.

\(^{47}\) Sun, “Dao xian lun,” in *Quan Jin wen* in *Quan Shanggu Sandai Qin Han Sanguo Liuchao wen* 全上古三代秦漢三國六朝文 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1958), 62.1813a.
Zhuang concepts largely frame the dialogue between the two friends as constructed by Sun Chuo.

答許詢詩九章  
Response to Xu Xun, A Poem in Nine Stanzas

仰觀大造  Upward we observe the Great Design,
俯覽時物  Downward we watch seasons' things.
機過患生  When opportunity passes, calamity arises,
吉凶相拂  Good and ill fortune press upon one another.
智以利昏  Wisdom is dulled by profit,48
識由情屈  Perspicacity is sapped by feelings.49
野有寒枯  In the wilds, there is withering from cold,
朝有炎鬱  While at court, there is stifling from heat.
失則震驚  If with failure you “tremble with fear,”50
得必充詘  With success, you'll surely “succumb to fullness.”51

峨峨高門  Tall and towering may be the lofty gates,
鬼闚其庭  Though ghosts can spy into those courtyards.
弈弈華輪  Sparkling and stunning may be the ornate wheels,
路險則傾  But perilous roads can overturn them.

48 Wisdom (zhi 智) and profit (li 利) are discussed in Laozi 19 as things to be discarded in order to revert back to simplicity and the Dao.

49 Perspicacity (shi 識) has a negative valency in the Laozi. In chapter 20, Laozi says: “I alone am doltish and rustic.” Wang Bi’s commentary explains this line by devalorizing perspicacity: “I have nothing that I want to do. I am so muddled and oafish that I appear to know nothing at all.” Wang Bi, 1:48; Lynn, 84. In chapter 38, “foreknowledge” (qianshi 前識) is defined as “the embellishment of the Dao and the beginning of dullness.” Wang Bi glosses foreknowledge as “knowing something before others,” which describes men of “inferior virtue,” who are activist and who labor over worldly matters, but only to achieve an adverse end. Better to embrace simplicity and the uncarved block (su pu 素樸), explains Wang Bi. See Wang Bi ji jiao shi, 1:94–5. The Heshang Gong edition of the Laozi has a line from chapter 57 “I am free of feeling, and the common folk achieve purity on their own” 我無情,民自清, in place of “I am free of desires, and the people achieve simplicity on their own” 我無欲,人自朴 in Wang Bi’s edition. See the comment in Bi Yuan’s 毕沅 Laozi Daodejing kaoyi, as cited in Laozi jiao shi 老子校釋, ed. Zhu Qianzhi 朱謙之 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1984).

50 “Tremble with fear” (zhen jing 震驚) is drawn from Shijing 263, “Chang wu” (Always mighty), a poem praising the Zhou king’s conquest of Xu (in the Huai River region).

51 “Succumb to fullness” (chong qu 充詘) is drawn from the Liji 礼記 (41.894): “Ru scholars do not lose integrity in poverty and low station, nor do they succumb to fullness in wealth and honor 不充詘於富貴.”
Up ahead, the carriage shaft has smashed its axle,
Behind, bird bells shake its grelots.
A general leads his troops in a hasty advance,
Regret comes only with an axe on one's neck.
Men of insight understand the causes:
Thus set aside self, leave behind honor.

Leave behind honor, and honor remains intact,
Set aside self, and self stays whole.
Peerless were our former teachers,
They “cultivated virtue and pursued leisure.”
They relaxed in the wind of mystery,
And washed themselves in the clear stream.
One walks on elevated ground,
Another is contented in the garden in Meng.
If the Way is complete and held within,
Then one’s spirit will settle in the boundless.

Alas! I am but an adolescent,
Endowed with mediocre qualities.
My capabilities don’t surpass the common,
My talents don’t stand out from the crowd.
I pull together my lapels and state my sincerity,

This paradox of casting aside X, but X remains preserved recalls a similar argument against valorization and meddling action in the Laozi; see, for example, chapter 66, which states that “It is because he does not contend that none among all under Heaven can contend with him.” Trans. Richard John Lynn, The Classic of the Way and Virtue: A New Translation of the Tao-Te Ching of Laozi as Interpreted by Wang Bi (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 1999), 173.

“Former teachers” refers to Laozi and Zhuangzi.
The phrase is taken from Zhuangzi 12, “Tiandi” (Heaven and earth): “When the world is without the Way, then he [the sage] cultivates his virtue and pursues leisure [i.e. retirement].” ZZJS, 12.421.
Chongji 崇基 may mean either “a high altar” or “a mountain,” hence my translation of it as “elevated ground.”
A reference to Zhuangzi, who according to the Shiji (63.2143), held a minor position in the “lacquer garden” (qi yuan 漆園) in Meng (in the state of Liang).
A reference to a well-known passage in the Mencius (2A/2), in which he spoke about being good at cultivating his “flood-like qi” (haoran zhi qi 浩然之氣). This qi, according to Mencius, conjoins rightness and the Way, and, if unobstructed, can fill the space between Heaven and Earth.
How dare I excuse myself because of my inadequate qualities?

May the unseen workings let me transcend feelings,

And meet me with a mystic detachment.

I lodge my mind in infinite vastness,

And savor the marvelous oneness.58

Father Kong has a saying:

“Those later born may be held in awe.”59

Bright and brilliant is Master Xu,

Outstandingly rare, strikingly singular.

Comparable to jade, likened to gemstone,

Matched with thoroughwort, equated with artemesia.

Entrusting his feelings to the Great Carpenter,60

He gazes upward with remote intent.

If he were to raise up something to a thousand ren,

How could he stop short of one basketful?61

Since I last clasped your hand,

Suddenly four years have passed.

We join in agreement with a single source,

And made a bond of friendship by the returning current.

In wading we are sure to harmonize our tastes,

In soaring we are sure to roam together.

Our joys accumulated with time,

Hence we became deeply close-knit.

“A single day without seeing you,”

A reference to the all-embracing unity of the Dao; see, example, Laozi 22 and 39.

A quotation from Analects 9/23 about how those later born may one day surpass their elders. The rest of the stanza reads as an encouraging praise of Xu Xun, who was younger than Sun Chuo.

The Great Carpenter in Laozi 74 is a figure of the Dao: “It rarely happens that one who tries to do the hewing instead of the great carpenter does not injure his own hand.” Trans. Lynn, The Classic of the Way and Virtue, 183. The lesson here is that one should not assume the work of the Dao (or the Great Carpenter) for action, something contrived, is injurious. This underscores the basic argument in the Laozi that non-action is best.

In Analects 9/19, Confucius says, “As in building a mound, if one basketful before completion, I stop, then I stopped. As in leveling the ground, if I tip over one basketful, I am advancing, then I have made progress.” The lesson is to make constant, unceasing effort, presumably in learning and progress toward the Way.

This is a digital offprint for restricted use only | © 2015 Koninklijke Brill NV
情兼三秋 Felt to me the same as “three autumns.”

矧乃路遐 All the more now that your road leads faraway,
致茲乖違 Here we have come to part ways.
爾託西隅 You will consign yourself to the western corner,
While I shall remain in this domain.

寂寂委巷 Quiet and still in a winding alley,
寥寥閑扉 Desolate and deserted: I shut my door.
淒風夜激 A bleak wind stirs at night,
皓雪晨霏 Pale white snow whirls at dawn.

貽我新詩 You presented me with a new poem,
靈旨清 Spiritual in resonance, pure in meaning.
輝如揮錦 Brilliant as a flattering brocade,
琅若叩瓊 Sonorous as carnelian when struck.
既欣夢解 You are glad since you have understood the dream,
但愧未冥 But still ashamed for not yet reaching the depths.
樂在忘生 Joy lies in “forgetting life.”
余則異矣 I am different from this,
無往不平 There is no going that is not leveled for me.

賞音者誰 Who is there to appreciate the tune?

62 See Shijing 72, “Cai ge”: “One day without seeing you,/ was like three autumns to me”一日 不見，如三秋兮.
63 Although Xu Xun’s poem to Sun Chuo is no longer extant, Sun seems to be summarizing and responding to the main point of Xu’s poem in this stanza.
64 A likely allusion to the dream of the skull in Zhuangzi i8 “Zhi le” (ZZJS, 18.617–19); see my discussion in this section. I thank Liu Yuan-ju of Academic Sinica for her insight on this allusion.
65 An allusion to Laozi 13: “What is meant by self-importance being ‘a great calamity that can cost one his person?’ The reason I suffer such a great calamity is that I am bound by my own person [you shen 有身, i.e. bodily existence]. When I am no longer bound by my own person, what calamity could befall me?” Trans. Lynn, The Classic of the Way and Virtue, 71.
66 A likely allusion to two passages in the Zhuangzi on forgetting about one’s person (wang qi shen 忘其身), seeing life and death as equal in value (“the reason I find it good to live is the same as why I find it good to die”), accepting the state of things (shi zhi qing 事之情 or wu zhi qing 物之情) and the fact that man cannot intervene with it. See Zhuangzi 4 “Ren shi jian,” in ZZJS, 4.155 and Zhuangzi 6 “Da zong shi,” in ZZJS, 6.241–44.
Why should we become entangled by feelings?67

Admonitions come from the ancients. Remote are the Nest Dweller and White Pates, A thousand years apart, cut off from the dust. Perched on a mountain in “exalted retreat,”68

There is also shouldering firewood. “Measuring one’s strength” and “keeping to the essential,”69

We dare to aspire to the men of the past. Store up these honest counsel,

Always to be written on one’s belted sash.70

This poem treats an issue central to the early medieval cultural discourse: any xuanxue adept worth his salt (or any other kind of mineral) weighed in on the question of worldly ambition versus high-minded disengagement. That the poem revolves around this one single issue further suggests that this problem was raised first by Xu Xun’s poem. We may infer the content of that poem (or at least part of it) from Sun’s answer, in particular stanza 8 (ll. 71–82) where Xu’s poem is directly referenced. Sun Chuo begins with a nod to the conventions of exchange poetry: he expresses high praise for Xu’s poem and acknowledges that he has appreciated the sound and sense of his friend’s communication. Then Sun appears to reiterate a key, if not main, point of Xu’s address: although Xu had expressed joy in having understood the meaning of “the dream,” he is still ashamed for not having attained a more profound level of understanding, that is to say, complete enlightenment: he still views his bodily existence as a

This refers to Wang Bi’s argument that the sages possess feelings like others but they respond to things without becoming attached to them. See Wang Bi’s biography by He Shao, as appended to Zhong Hui’s biography in Sanguo zhi, 28.795.

This is a phrase from Yijing hexagram 33, “Dun” (Retreat). The Fifth Yang line statement reads: “Exalted retreat, in which constancy brings good fortune.”

In Zuo zhuan, Duke Yin 11, the Marquis of Xi sent his general to attack the state of Zheng, “without having first gauged one’s own virtue, measured one’s own strength” 不度德，不量力. This led to disastrous results for Xi. “Keeping to the essential” (shou yue 守约) appears in Mencius 7B/32, signifying the gentlemanly virtue of holding onto the basic and simple. “Keeping to the essential and giving it broad application is a good way... What the gentleman keeps to is cultivating his own person, and this brings order to all under Heaven.”

Xian-Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao shi, 899–900. In Analects 15/6 Zizhang wrote down Confucius’ good counsel on the ends of his sash.
source of resentment and being able to forget life as cause for joy. The dream refers not to the famous Zhuangzi-butterfly episode about accessing reality and epistemology in the *Inner Chapters*, but probably alludes to the dream of the skull in *Zhuangzi* 18, "Ultimate Happiness," whose theme of death's value in relation to life better accords with the rest of the stanza. In that story Zhuangzi goes to Chu and finds an old, dried-up skull. He asks it: “were you greedy for life and lost your reason” that you came to this? The skull then appears in Zhuangzi’s dream that very night and divulges the secret of the perfect happiness found in death, which signifies in the story a realm of absolute freedom transcending all constraints of time and duty. The skull concludes that he would not trade death for life, which is defined as “troubles” (*lao*). Although Xu may have grasped the signification of this dream, he still feels the demands placed on one’s existence (e.g., honor, favor, station) and the burden of valuing life over death. This must remain Sun’s account of Xu’s poem.

Whether or not Sun Chuo made a fair reading of Xu’s poem is an impossible line of inquiry to pursue. What is useful and more germane to the subject at hand is the fact that he uses this characterization of Xu, developed through a series of allusions to the *Laozi* and *Zhuangzi*, to make a major claim about his own attitude: he is different from Xu (“I am different from this,” l. 79), since he suffers neither the resentment nor joy of life or death (“There is no going that is not leveled for me,” l. 80). Given the way things are in the world, Sun knows not to become entangled by his feelings (“Why should we become entangled by feelings?” l. 82). Alluding to Wang Bi’s famous response to He Yan about how sages may respond to things with feelings but without any burdensome attachment, Sun Chuo casts himself in the role of the sage and, by extension, his younger friend the student. At play here seems less an implicit critique of Xu Xun’s alleged spiritual deficiency than an indirect justification of Sun Chuo’s known material choices. Contemporary accounts portray Sun as a shameless braggadocio and careerist with a knack for self-promotion. All of this was forgiven because he was judged to be peerless in his literary talent. Sun Chuo here makes a familiar argument: why should engagement with worldly affairs matter so long as one is free of the emotional weight of it? Sun Chuo’s message to his reader is clear: true enlightenment for him hinges upon the mind, not matter.

Earlier in the poem Sun Chuo describes his real aspirations in the grandest of spiritual terms, transcending all physical space:

或歩崇基  One walks on elevated ground,
Another is contented in the garden in Meng.

If the Way is complete and held within,

Then one’s spirit will settle in the boundless.

(ll. 27–30)

May the unseen workings let me transcend feelings,

And meet me with a mystic detachment.

I lodge my mind in infinite vastness,

And savor the marvelous oneness.

(ll. 37–40)

Whether one treads the mountainous path (“elevated ground”) of a recluse or finds complacency in a government position, as Zhuangzi did, place and position lose all relevancy if one can harness the Way within, thus enabling one’s spirit to ascend into the boundless.

Sun Chuo claims to have transcended the physical distinction between reclusion and office by locating his spirit and mind (qi “perch,” zhai “lodge”) somewhere in infinite space. This leveling of service and reclusion by introducing a higher gauge, mental state, matches Xie An’s strategy as seen in his poem to Wang Huzhi. In an interesting coincidence, it also correlates with an argument Sun Chuo made elsewhere against Xie An’s younger brother, Xie Wan 謝萬 (ca. 320–361), who had opined in his “Discourse on Eight Worthies” 八賢論 that recluses were superior to men in office. Sun Chuo contradicted him by declaring, “for those who embody the mysterious and comprehend the remote, service and reclusion are the same.”72 This stance may certainly have been pragmatic, as it surely was for many men in Sun Chuo’s era, for it allowed one (especially a career climber and xuan-learning adept) to lay claim to both the advantages of office and the high-mindedness of reclusion. As with Xie An, Sun Chuo reconciles between the two poles and rids the discourse of its sterile binary nature by casting light on the subtler shades in between.

The opening stanzas of Sun Chuo’s poem lay out both options—office and withdrawal—and forestall any quick judgment in favor of the more obvious virtue, withdrawal, within the cultural discourse of the time. To be sure, Sun duly points out the usual difficulties and dangers that beset a courtier: a sense of suffocation (“at court, there is stifling from heat,” l.8); unexpected threats (in the metaphors of ghosts that haunt a household and perilous roads that overturn carriages, ll.11–15); and death (in the blunt, literal image of an executioner’s “axe on one’s neck,” l.18). Danger lurks behind a grand and

---

72 See Shishuo xinyu jianshu, 4/91 (p. 270).
attractive appearance that is courtly life, here figured by towering gates and ornate wheels. But Sun also quite frankly acknowledges the disadvantage of withdrawal: “In the wilds, there is withering from cold.” Without the life-sustaining heat of the sun, metaphor for the emperor, one becomes reduced in consequence, hence suffers desolation. Furthermore, Sun Chuo challenges the conventional early medieval valuation of reclusion as lofty and office holding as base, a view articulated in Xie Wan’s essay, by identifying the source of trouble not in government service, but in emotional entanglement.

The line between service and withdrawal is decidedly and perhaps pointedly blurred in Sun Chuo’s portrait of his quietist life in stanza 7 of the poem.

 [...] 

爾託西隅  You will consign yourself to the western corner,
我滞斯畿  While I shall remain in this domain.
寂寂委巷  Quiet and still in a winding alley,
寥寥閑扉  Desolate and deserted: I shut my door.
淒風夜激  A bleak wind stirs at night,
皓雪晨霏  Pale white snow whirls at dawn.
隱机獨詠  Leaning against my armrest, I sing alone.
賞音者誰  Who is there to appreciate the tune?

The places to which “western corner” and “this domain” refer cannot be ascertained since there are too many blanks in the biographies of Xu and Sun, though the poem was most likely written in the 340’s. Sun Chuo and Xu Xun became friends during their youth while both lived in Guiji and were said to have shared lofty-minded intentions. According to extant accounts, Xu Xun was once summoned to office but did not accept the post, whereas Sun Chuo

---

73 See Sun Chuo’s biography in Jin shu, 56.1544.
74 Liu Xiaobiao 劉孝標 cites the following from Tan Daoluan’s 檀道鸞 (fl. 459) Xu Jin yangqiu 續晉陽秋 in his Shishuo xinyu commentary (2/69): “[Xu Xun] was summoned as Clerk to the Minister of Education (situ yuan 司徒掾), but declined to serve.” He Fasheng’s 何法盛 (Liu Song) Jin zhong xing shu 晉中興書 corroborates this information, which is cited by Li Shan in his commentary to Jiang Yan’s poem in imitation of Xu Xun. See Wen xuan 文選 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1986), 31.1469. In several entries of Shishuo xinyu (e.g., 4/40), Xu Xun is referred to as “Clerk Xu,” which suggests that Xu held such a post. However, this contradicts all other sources about Xu’s resume (or lack thereof). Cao Daoheng seems to believe that Xu was referred to as “Clerk Xu” in Shishuo xinyu simply on the basis of having been summoned to the post. See Cao, Zhonggu wen-xueshi lunwen ji 中古文學史論文集 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002), 314. More recently,
successfully climbed the official ladder and held a string of posts throughout
his life. It is for his perceived irresoluteness that Sun was mocked and de-
spised by many of his contemporaries, according to the Shishuo xinyu and Tan
Daoluan’s 檀道鸞 (fl. 459) Xu Jin yanqiu 續晉陽秋 (Continuation of the ann-
als of Jin). Whether the “western corner” refers to the capital and “this do-
main” Guiji, and by extension, Xu Xun is leaving for the capital to assume a post
while Sun Chuo remains away from court, is beyond the reach of historical re-
search, especially given the extreme paucity of records on Xu Xun. It should be
noted, however, that by available accounts, Xu Xun traveled west to the capital
twice and neither trip involved assuming office. Thus, even if “western corner”
indeed refers to the capital, Xu Xun may not necessarily be traveling there to
assume office. What is clear in this stanza, however, is an illustration of the
poet’s consistent point throughout the poem that the virtue of reclusion con-
sists in the mind, rather than the place. Sun’s portrait of his quietist life is set in
the midst of civilization (alleyway in a town), not in the mountains, thereby
highlighting the primacy of a detached mind. His poem does not offer us
enough clues to determine whether he was in fact living in retreat (none of the
available historical sources indicate that he was ever out of office for any sub-
stantial period of time), but that seems irrelevant to the poem’s overall sugges-
tion: given a transcendent mental state that is without emotional entanglement,
the difference between service or withdrawal entails little consequence. This
serves as a reminder that the rhetoric of quietism and hiddenness cannot be
easily grafted onto biography and did not readily translate into actual with-
drawal from office during medieval China. A picture of a quietist life that blurs
any meaningful boundary between the court and the wilds and that espouses

---

Gu Nong explicitly makes such an argument in his essay, “Yi shi wenzong’: Xu Xun de

75 Jin shu, 56.1544. Wenzhang zhi 文章志, compiled under the Liu-Song Emperor Ming (r.
465–72), sharply contrasts the lives of the two men: “Chuo was widely read in the Classics
and histories, and excelled in literary composition. He and Xu Xun both talked in terms of
turning their backs on the world, but while Xun, to the day of his death, never compro-
mised his determination, Chuo became deeply enmeshed in worldly affairs.” Quoted in

76 See Shishuo xinyu 9/61.

77 According to one entry in the Shishuo xinyu, Xu Xun left the hills of Zhejiang to go to
Jiankang to meet his elder sister (8/144; a similar account in 8/95, which states that he
went to the capital to escort his mother home, may be an error). Another Shishuo entry
(2/69) describes Xu Xun’s visit with Liu Tan, who became Intendant (yin 尹) of Danyang,
which lies just outside the capital, in the twelfth month of 347, according to Xu Song 徐
spiritual transcendence above all else certainly fits within the parameters of a defense for having chosen a careerist path.

It seems to me that the main interest of Sun Chuo’s response to Xu Xun lies in the nuances of his discussion of reclusion, rather than its obvious exaltation of famous recluses, cast in broad strokes. The Nest Dweller and the Four White Pates, token symbols of reclusion, are evoked in the last stanza as models to which Sun and Xu might aspire.

戒以古人
Amonitions come from the ancients.
邈彼巢皓
Remote are the Nest Dweller and White Pates,
千載絕塵
A thousand years apart, cut off from the dust.
山棲嘉遯
Perched on a mountain in “exalted retreat,”
亦有負薪
There is also shouldering firewood.
量力守約
“Measuring one’s strength” and “keeping to the essential,”
敢希先人
We dare to aspire to the men of the past.
且戢讜言
Store up these honest counsel,
永以書紳
Always to be written on one’s belted sash.

Yet the concluding lines of the poem suggest that this evocation is far from being a simple, unqualified valorization of reclusion. Sun points out the material fact that even those who enjoy “exalted retreat” in the mountains still have the burden of shouldering firewood. He also turns to lessons from the Zuo zhuan and Mencius, core texts from the classicist canon, that call for application according to individualized circumstances: “measuring one’s own strength” and “keeping to the essential,” or cultivating oneself, respectively. He wraps up his communication to his younger friend by asking that Xu Xun take note of his “honest counsel” in the manner of Zizhang 子張, who recorded Confucius’ wise words on the ends of his sash. This counsel has conveyed the difficulties of a career at court, the disadvantages of life in withdrawal, and the view that the highest measure of transcendence is not one’s material position (as a courtier or recluse), but rather one’s spiritual detachment and lack of emotional entanglement.

If taken at face value, this counsel seems oddly inappropriate given that the poem’s recipient was a famed resolute recluse, whose high-mindedness was elsewhere acknowledged by Sun Chuo himself. According to the Shishuo xinyu, Zhi Dun once asked Sun Chuo to compare himself with Xu Xun. Sun replied thus: “as far as exalted feelings and remote intent [gaoqing yuanzhi 高情遠致] are concerned, your disciple has long since inwardly conceded Xu’s superiority. But in the matter of a single humming or a single intoning of poetry, Xu will
need to sit facing north [as a student before a teacher]." Sun Chuo’s self-representation and representation of Xu Xun in this poem puts into question to what extent he did in fact renounce any pretension to a superior state of mind. The “counsel" he bestows upon his friend seems more an opportunity to make a case for himself, his choices, and his superior understanding.

A gift of a poem not only demanded the return of an affirmation of a social bond but also often initiated the social sport of one-upmanship. The aspects of performance and competition in “pure conversation" carried into the poetic exchanges of the Eastern Jin. The literati quoted extensively from the Three Mysterious Works to make arguments as well as counter-arguments about big topics of the day, such as office versus reclusion and self-cultivation. Xuanxue furnished early medieval writers with a diversified repertoire of textual sources, methods, and interpretations from which they may choose and adapt to their purposes. Through xuan discourse writers could treat such gross categories as service, quietism, and the ideal character, with nuance and subtlety. We have seen in two examples above how one such move—to nullify the distinction between service and withdrawal—advanced and refined the debate on this dichotomy, regardless of whether the motivation was philosophical sophistication or material pragmatism, or a combination of both. The same cultural toolkit could be selectively appropriated by writers to make different claims: Zhuangzi’s “Qi wu lun" (and its commentary) could be used to support an argument that there is no distinction between service and withdrawal, or it could be used to make the claim that while differences do really exist, the true measure is for each to fulfill its own nature and capacity. Poetic communication through allusions from the Three Mysterious Works reached new heights during the Eastern Jin. Exchange poetry gave the gentry elite an important venue to trade in literary competence (and sometimes best their interlocutor), to exhibit their possession of the cultural currency of the day, and to identify members of their own group.

78 Shishuo xinyu, 9/54. I have used Mather’s translation with a slight modification; see Shih-shuo Hsin-yü, 283.